

# THE STATES assembled on Thursday 21st October 2010, at 09.30 a.m. under the Presidency of the Deputy Bailiff, William James Bailhache, Esquire.

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Frederick Ellyer Cohen – en défaut

Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.36 a.m.)

Deputy Carolyn Fiona Labey of Grouville – excused attendance (arrived in the Chamber at 12.15 p.m.)

Deputy Shona Pitman of St. Helier – ill

Deputy Michael Roderick Higgins of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.10 a.m.)

Deputy Deborah Jane De Sousa of St. Helier – ill

Prayers read by the Deputy Bailiff

# **Notification of lodged propositions**

Draft Magistrate's Court (Miscellaneous Provisions) (Amendment No. 10) (Jersey) Law 201-.

P.155/2010.

Lodged: 21st October 2010.

Chief Minister.

# Jersey Finance Ltd.: matched funding P.126/2010

THE STATES rejected a proposition of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier to express their support for the principle of matched funding for Jersey Finance Ltd. on a £ for £ basis, excluding any allowance for 'pro bono' work, between the States of Jersey and the private sector; and to request the Minister for Economic Development to apply that principle to the 2012 grant to the company.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 8 CONTRE: 37 ABSTAIN: 0

Senator A. Breckon Senator T.A. Le Sueur Deputy J.A. Martin (H) Senator P.F. Routier Deputy G.P. Southern (H) Senator P.F.C. Ozouf Deputy M. Tadier (B) Senator T.J. Le Main Deputy of St. Mary Senator B.E. Shenton Deputy T.M. Pitman (H) Senator J.L. Perchard Deputy T.A. Vallois (S) Senator S.C. Ferguson Deputy M.R. Higgins (H) Senator A.J.H. Maclean Senator B.I. Le Marquand Senator F. du H. Le Gresley Connétable of St. Ouen Connétable of St. Helier Connétable of Trinity Connétable of Grouville

433 Price code: B

Connétable of St. Brelade

Connétable of St. Saviour

Connétable of St. Clement

Connétable of St. Peter

Connétable of St. Lawrence

Connétable of St. Mary

Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)

Deputy of St. Martin

Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)

Deputy I.B. For (II)

Deputy J.B. Fox (H)

Deputy of St. Peter

Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)

Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)

Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)

Deputy of Trinity

Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)

Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)

Deputy of St. John

Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)

Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)

Deputy E.J. Noel (L)

Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

# States Members' remuneration: reconsideration of 2011 increase and repeal of Article 44 of the States of Jersey Law 2005 P.127/2010

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of Senator Ben Edward Shenton concerning the remuneration of States Members and, adopting an amendment the Deputy of St. Mary to paragraph (a), agreed that the words "in light of current and projected economic circumstances" should be deleted.

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Judith Ann Martin of St. Helier that in paragraph (b) of the proposition of Senator Ben Edward Shenton, for the words "taking account of factors such as the positions of official responsibility held by elected members" there should be substituted the words "including the reintroduction of a means-tested system of remuneration which takes account of the total income of each individual States member,".

Members present voted as follows -

## POUR: 13 CONTRE: 26 ABSTAIN: 1

Senator A. Breckon Senator P.F. Routier Senator F. du H. Le Gresley Senator T.J. Le Main Connétable of St. Helier Senator B.E. Shenton Connétable of St. Clement Senator S.C. Ferguson Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S) Senator B.I. Le Marquand Deputy J.A. Martin (H) Connétable of St. Ouen Deputy of Grouville Connétable of Trinity Deputy of Trinity Connétable of St. Brelade Deputy M. Tadier (B) Connétable of St. Martin Deputy T.M. Pitman (H) Connétable of St. Saviour Deputy M.R. Higgins (H) Connétable of St. Peter Connétable of St. Lawrence Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

Connétable of Grouville

Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

Connétable of St. Mary
Deputy of St. Martin
Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
Deputy of St. Ouen
Deputy of St. Peter
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
Deputy of St. Mary
Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of Senator Ben Edward Shenton, as amended, concerning the remuneration of States Members and, adopting a proposition of Senator Francis du Heaume Le Gresley, agreed in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 84, that the matter should be put to the vote.

Members present voted as follows -

**POUR: 25** 

Senator T.A. Le Sueur Senator T.J. Le Main Senator J.L. Perchard Senator S.C. Ferguson Senator A.J.H. Maclean Senator B.I. Le Marquand Senator F. du H. Le Gresley Connétable of St. Ouen Connétable of St. Helier Connétable of Trinity Connétable of Grouville Connétable of St. Martin Connétable of St. Saviour Connétable of St. Clement Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S) Deputy of St. Martin Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)

Deputy of Trinity
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)

Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)

**CONTRE: 16** 

Senator P.F. Routier Senator A. Breckon Connétable of St. Brelade Connétable of St. Peter Connétable of St. Lawrence Connétable of St. Mary Deputy J.A. Martin (H) Deputy G.P. Southern (H) Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H) Deputy M. Tadier (B) Deputy A.E. Jeune (B) Deputy of St. Mary Deputy T.M. Pitman (H) Deputy M.R. Higgins (H) Deputy A.K.F. Green (H) Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**ABSTAIN: 2** 

Senator B.E. Shenton Deputy of St. John

THE STATES adopted paragraph (a) of the proposition of Senator Ben Edward Shenton, as amended, and –

(a) (requested the Privileges and Procedures Committee to) request the States Members' Remuneration Review Body to review its recommendation for an £800 increase in remuneration for elected members from 1st January 2011 as set out in R.93/2010.

Members present voted as follows –

# **POUR: 28**

Senator P.F. Routier Senator P.F.C. Ozouf Senator T.J. Le Main Senator B.E. Shenton Senator J.L. Perchard Senator A. Breckon Senator S.C. Ferguson Senator A.J.H. Maclean Senator F. du H. Le Gresley Connétable of St. Helier Connétable of St. Martin Connétable of St. Peter Connétable of St. Lawrence Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S) Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S) Deputy J.A. Martin (H) Deputy of Grouville Deputy J.A. Hilton (H) Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H) Deputy of Trinity Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B) Deputy K.C. Lewis (S) Deputy I.J. Gorst (C) Deputy A.E. Jeune (B) Deputy T.M. Pitman (H) Deputy A.T. Dupré (C) Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

# **CONTRE: 12**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur Senator B.I. Le Marquand Connétable of St. Ouen Connétable of St. Saviour Connétable of St. Clement Connétable of St. Mary Deputy of St. Martin Deputy G.P. Southern (H) Deputy of St. Peter Deputy M. Tadier (B) Deputy of St. Mary Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

#### **ABSTAIN: 5**

Connétable of Trinity Connétable of Grouville Connétable of St. Brelade Deputy E.J. Noel (L) Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)

THE STATES rejected paragraph (b) of the proposition of Senator Ben Edward Shenton, as amended, requesting the Privileges and Procedures Committee to -

(b) agree that Article 44 of the States of Jersey Law 2005, which currently prevented the payment of different amounts of remuneration or allowances to different elected members, should be repealed and to agree that, following its repeal, the States Members' Remuneration Review Body should be requested to bring forward a scheme of differential remuneration for elected members for 2012 and beyond, taking account of factors such as the positions of official responsibility held by elected members ensuring that there was nevertheless no overall increase (other than any normal annual inflationary increase) in the total budget for States members' remuneration;

Members present voted as follows -

## POUR: 13 CONTRE: 31 ABSTAIN: 2

Senator T.A. Le Sueur Senator T.J. Le Main Senator P.F. Routier Senator S.C. Ferguson Senator P.F.C. Ozouf Senator B.I. Le Marquand Senator B.E. Shenton Senator F. du H. Le Greslev Connétable of St. Helier Senator J.L. Perchard Connétable of St. Brelade Senator A. Breckon Senator A.J.H. Maclean Connétable of St. Martin Connétable of St. Ouen Connétable of St. Saviour Connétable of Trinity Connétable of St. Clement Connétable of St. Peter Connétable of St. Lawrence Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S) Connétable of St. Mary Deputy J.A. Martin (H) Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S) Deputy I.J. Gorst (C) Deputy of St. Martin Deputy G.P. Southern (H) Deputy of Grouville Deputy of St. Peter Deputy J.A. Hilton (H) Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H) Deputy of Trinity Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B) Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)

Connétable of Grouville Deputy of St. John

Following the rejection of paragraph (b), the Presiding Officer informed the Assembly that paragraph (c) of the proposition was deemed to have been withdrawn.

Deputy M. Tadier (B)
Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
Deputy of St. Mary
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

# **Changes in Presidency**

The Deputy Bailiff retired from the Chamber during consideration of the amendment of Deputy Judith Ann Martin of St. Helier to paragraph (b) of the proposition of Senator Ben Edward Shenton concerning the remuneration of States Members and the meeting continued under the presidency of Mr. Michael Nelson de la Haye, Greffier of the States until the lunch adjournment. The States re-assembled after the lunch adjournment under the Presidency of the Deputy Bailiff.

## **Arrangement of public business for future meetings**

THE STATES agreed the following arrangement of public business for future meetings proposed, as amended, by the Chairman of the Privileges and Procedures Committee in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 88(3) –

## 2nd November 2010

Sites of Special Interest: removal from list. P.96/2010. Lodged: 7th July 2010. Senator J.L. Perchard. Sites of Special Interest: removal from list (P.96/2010) – comments. P.96/2010. Presented: 13th September 2010. Com. Minister for Planning and Environment. Draft Community Provisions (Bovine Embryos) (Jersey) Regulations 201-. P.115/2010. Lodged: 17th August 2010. Minister for Planning and Environment. Draft Health Insurance Fund (Miscellaneous Provisions) (Jersey) Law 201-. P.125/2010. Lodged: 13th September 2010. Minister for Social Security. Reg's Skips Limited – Planning Applications (R.118/2010): compensation and further P.130/2010. action. Lodged: 28th September 2010. Senator B.E. Shenton. Reg's Skips Limited – Planning Applications (R.118/2010): compensation and further P.130/2010. action (P.130/2010) - amendment. Amd. Lodged: 4th October 2010. Deputy of St. John. Reg's Skips Limited – Planning Applications (R.118/2010): compensation and further P.130/2010. action (P.130/2010) – third amendment. Amd.(3)Lodged: 19th October 2010. Minister for Planning and Environment. Reg's Skips Limited – Planning Applications (R.118/2010): compensation and further P.130/2010. action (P.130/2010) – fourth amendment. Amd.(4)Lodged: 19th October 2010. Senator F. du H. Le Gresley. Minister for Planning and Environment: powers. P.132/2010. Lodged: 5th October 2010. Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier of St. Saviour. Esplanade Quarter: deferment of works and endorsement of Development Agreement. P.136/2010. Lodged: 7th October 2010. Deputy of St. John. Children (Jersey) Law 2002: appointment of children's guardians and advocates in certain P.137/2010. court proceedings. Lodged: 7th October 2010. Deputy of St. Martin.

P.138/2010.

Postal services: direction and guidance to the Jersey Competition Regulatory Authority.

Lodged: 7th October 2010.

Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.

Rent control: removal of exemptions. P.139/2010. Lodged: 8th October 2010. Senator F. du H. Le Gresley. Jersey Post: petition. P.140/2010. Lodged: 11th October 2010. Deputy J.A. Martin of St. Helier. Draft Employment (Amendment No. 5) (Jersey) Law 2010 (Appointed Day) Act 201-. P.142/2010. Lodged: 12th October 2010. Minister for Social Security. Fiscal Policy Panel: re-appointment of members. P.146/2010. Lodged: 13th October 2010. Minister for Treasury and Resources. Jersey Police Complaints Authority: re-appointment of member. P.147/2010. Lodged: 18th October 2010. Minister for Home Affairs. 16th November 2010 Planning and Building Law: repeal of Minister's power to grant permission that is P.78/2010. inconsistent with the Island Plan. Lodged: 10th June 2010. Senator B.E. Shenton. North of Town Masterplan (Revised). P.103/2010. Lodged: 19th July 2010. Minister for Planning and Environment. North of Town Masterplan (Revised) (P.103/2010): addendum. P.103/2010. Presented: 3rd August 2010. Add. Minister for Planning and Environment. North of Town Masterplan (Revised) (P.103/2010): second amendment. P.103/2010. Lodged: 9th August 2010. Amd.(2)Deputy A.K.F. Green of St. Helier. Sustainable Transport Policy. P.104/2010. Lodged: 19th July 2010. Minister for Transport and Technical Services P.117/2010. Social Security Scheme: amendments. Lodged: 20th August 2010. Senator A. Breckon. User Pays charges: use of the trade marks "Jersey Royal" or "Jersey Royals" (words) and P.119/2010. the Jersey Royal Logo. Lodged: 20th August 2010. Minister for Economic Development. Samarès Nursery site, St. Clement: removal from draft Island Plan – petition. P.131/2010.

Lodged: 1st October 2010. Connétable of St. Clement.

Draft Policing of Parks (Amendment No. 2) (Jersey) Regulations 201-. P.135/2010. Lodged: 6th October 2010. Minister for Transport and Technical Services. Income Support: mortgage payments. P.149/2010 Lodged: 19th October 2010. Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier. Jersey Financial Services Commission: imposition of fines. P.150/2010. Lodged: 19th October 2010. Senator A. Breckon. Rezoned Sites: assessment of housing needs. P.152/2010. Lodged: 19th October 2010. Deputy of St. John. Social Security Fund: a new method of funding. P.154/2010. Lodged: 20th October 2010. Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier. 30th November 2010 Media Relations: Code of Conduct. P.100/2010. Lodged: 15th July 2010. Privileges and Procedures Committee. Media Relations: Code of Conduct (P.100/2010) – amendment. P.100/2010. Lodged: 2nd September 2010. Amd. Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier of St. Saviour. Draft Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 201-. P.101/2010. Lodged: 19th July 2010. Privileges and Procedures Committee. Draft Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 201- (P.101/2010): comments. P.101/2010. Presented: 6th October 2010. Com. Council of Ministers. Draft Intellectual Property (Unregistered Rights) (Jersey) Law 201-. P.141/2010. Lodged: 12th October 2010. Minister for Economic Development. Draft Employment (Amendment No. 6) (Jersey) Law 201-. P.143/2010. Lodged: 12th October 2010. Minister for Social Security. Draft Harbours (Protection of Cables in Territorial Waters) (Jersey) Regulations 201-. P.144/2010. Lodged: 13th October 2010. Minister for Economic Development. Freedom of Information: implementation plan. P.145/2010. Lodged: 13th October 2010. Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier of St. Saviour.

Draft Housing (General Provisions) (Amendment No. 27) (Jersey) Regulations 201-.

P.151/2010.

Lodged: 19th October 2010.

Minister for Housing.

Draft Rates (Amendment of Law) (Jersey) Regulations 201-.

P.153/2010

Lodged: 19th October 2010. Comité des Connétables.

7th December 2010

Jersey Financial Services Commission: Companies' Register.

P.87/2010.

Lodged: 22nd June 2010.

Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire of St. Helier.

Jersey Financial Services Commission: Companies' Register (P.87/2010) – comments.

P.87/2010.

Com.

Presented: 28th September 2010.

Draft Income Tax (Amendment No. 36) (Jersey) Law 201-.

P.121/2010.

Lodged: 27th August 2010.

Minister for Treasury and Resources.

Minister for Economic Development.

Draft Magistrate's Court (Miscellaneous Provisions) (Amendment No. 10) (Jersey) Law

P.155/2010.

201-.

Lodged: 21st October 2010.

Chief Minister.

# **18th January 2011**

Draft Loi (No. 7) (201-) concernant la charge de Juge d'Instruction.

P.148/2010.

Lodged: 19th October 2010.

Chief Minister.

THE STATES rose at 4.24 p.m.

M.N. DE LA HAYE

Greffier of the States